# **ATTACHMENT 47**

Pontius, Robert August 29, 2013

	1
IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA	
30(B)(6) DEPOSITION OF ROBERT PONTIUS August 29, 2013	
VOLUME 1	
Reported by Brooke R. Bohr CSR No. 753	

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

2 (Pages 2 to 5)

	2 (1 ages 2 to 3)
2	4
<sup>1</sup> DEPOSITION OF ROBERT PONTIUS, taken at	1 APPEARANCES
the instance of the Defendants, at the Grove	2
<sup>3</sup> Hotel, 245 S. Capitol Boulevard, in the City of	<sup>3</sup> FOR ROSE ACRE FARMS
Boise, State of Idaho, commencing at 9:19 a.m., on	<sup>4</sup> Molly S. Crabtree
<sup>5</sup> August 29, 2013, before Brooke R. Bohr, CSR, RPR,	5 PORTER WRIGHT MORRIS & ARTHUR LLP
<sup>6</sup> a Notary Public in and for the State of Idaho,	<sup>6</sup> 41 South High Street, Suites 2800-3200
pursuant to notice, and in accordance with the	<sup>7</sup> Columbus, OH 43215-6194
<sup>8</sup> applicable Rules of Civil Procedure.	<sup>8</sup> (614) 227-2015
9	9 mcrabtree@porterwright.com
10	10
11	11 FOR NUCAL FOODS, INC.
12	(Appearing telephonically)
13	<sup>13</sup> Margaret Ziemianek
14	14 KASOWITZ, BENSON, TORRES & FRIEDMAN LLP
15	101 California Street, Suite 2300
16	San Francisco, California 94111
17	<sup>17</sup> (415) 421-6140
18	mziemianek@kasowitz.com
19	19
20	20
21	21
22	22
3	5
1 APPEARANCES	1 APPEARANCES
2	2
<sup>3</sup> FOR ALBERTSONS LLC AND ROBERT PONTIUS	<sup>3</sup> FOR MICHAEL FOODS, INC.
<sup>4</sup> Kevin J. Murray	4 (Appearing telephonically)
5 KENNY NACHWALTER	<sup>5</sup> Sharon Markowitz
<sup>6</sup> 1100 Miami Center, 201 S. Biscayne Boulevard	6 LEONARD, STREET & DEINARD, P.A.
<sup>7</sup> Miami, FL 33131-4327	<sup>7</sup> 150 South Fifth Street, Suite 2300
<sup>8</sup> (305) 373-1000	8 Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402
<sup>9</sup> kmurray@kennynachwalter.com	<sup>9</sup> (612) 335-7252
10	Sharon.Markowitz@leonard.com
<sup>11</sup> Brian D. Bethke	11
12 LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN D. BETHKE	FOR SPARBOE FARMS, INC.
950 W. Bannock Street	(Appearing telephonically)
<sup>14</sup> Boise, ID	14 Troy Hutchinson
<sup>15</sup> (208) 319-3811	BRIGGS AND MORGAN
16	<sup>16</sup> 80 South Eighth Street
17 FOR THE INDIRECT PURCHASERS	<sup>17</sup> Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402
<sup>18</sup> Keith D. Essenmacher	18 (612) 977-8400
19 LOVELL STEWART HALEBIAN LLP	<sup>19</sup> thutchinson@briggs.com
<sup>20</sup> 500 Fifth Avenue	20
New York, NY 10110	<sup>21</sup> VIDEOGRAPHER:
<sup>22</sup> (212) 608-1900	<sup>22</sup> Chris Ennis

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

3 (Pages 6 to 9)

11		$\overline{}$	
	6		8
1	WITNESS	1	MR. ESSENMACHER: Keith Essenmacher on
<sup>2</sup> ROBE	ERT PONTIUS Page:	2	behalf of the indirect purchasers.
3	Examination by Ms. Crabtree 9	3	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: And if you can swear the
4	Examination by Mr. Murray 85	4	witness.
5		5	THE REPORTER: Okay
6	* * * *	6	MS. MARKOWITZ: Sharon Markowitz for
7		7	Michael Foods. Sorry.
8	EXHIBITS	8	THE REPORTER: Please raise your right
9	Page:	9	hand.
10 Alberts	ons Exhibit 1 Notice of Deposition 17	10	MS. ZIEMIANEK: Margaret Ziemianek,
11 Alberts	ons Exhibit 2 Supplemental Responses 36	11	Kasowitz Benson Torres & Friedman for NuCal Foods.
12 Alberts	ons Exhibit 3 Albertsons Promotional Offer 40	12	THE REPORTER: Could you say that one more
13	Form	13	time? I'm sorry. I didn't catch the end.
14 Alberts	ons Exhibit 4 Co-Pack Purchase Agreement 49	14	MS. ZIEMIANEK: Margaret Ziemianek of
15 Alberts	ons Exhibit 5 Quote 52	15	Kasowitz Benson Torres & Friedman for NuCal Foods.
16 Alberts	ons Exhibit 6 Packaging Cost Spreadsheet 60	16	THE REPORTER: Thank you.
17 Alberts	ons Exhibit 7 First Amendment to 73	17	Okay. Please raise your right hand.
18	Our Own Brands Supply Agreement	18	
19 Alberts	ons Exhibit 8 Spreadsheet 77	19	ROBERT PONTIUS,
20		20	produced as a witness at the instance of the
21	* * * *	21	Defendants, having been first duly sworn, was
22		22	examined and testified as follows:
	7		9
<sup>1</sup> BOIS	SE, IDAHO	1	
<sup>2</sup> Augu	ıst 29, 2013, 9:19 a.m.	2	EXAMINATION
3		3	BY MS. CRABTREE:
4 T	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. So the camera	4	Q. Good morning.
5 is rol	ling, and we're on the record. We are	5	A. Good morning.
6 video	otaping this deposition. My name is Chris	6	Q. Long, though, it's been already.
	s. I'm the owner of NuVision Productions,	7	Could you please state your name for
<sup>8</sup> 5178	South Sweetgrass here in Boise, Idaho.	8	the record.
9	Today's date is August 29th. The	9	A. Robert Pontius.
	oximate time is 9:19 a.m. mountain time.	10	Q. Mr. Pontius, by whom are you employed?
	y's deposition is being taken at The Grove	11	A. Albertsons LLC.
	I in Boise, Idaho.	12	Q. And how long have you worked for
13	The deponent's name is Bob Pontius.	13	Albertsons LLC?
	if the counsel in the room and on the phones	14	A. A little over three years.
	dentify themselves, please.	15	Q. So you started in 2009 or '10?
	MS. CRABTREE: Molly Crabtree for Rose Acre	16	A. '10.
17 Farm		17	Q. And who did you work for before
18 N	IR. MURRAY: Kevin Murray from Kenny	18	Albertsons LLC?
	walter on behalf of Albertsons LLC and the	19	A. Acosta Sales and Marketing.
19 Nach			
Nach	ess, Mr. Pontius.	20	Q. Can you spell that?
<sup>19</sup> Nach	ess, Mr. Pontius. AR. BETHKE: Brian Bethke for Albertsons	20 21 22	<ul><li>Q. Can you spell that?</li><li>A. A-c-o-s-t-a Sales and Marketing.</li><li>Q. And what did you do for Acosta Sales</li></ul>

Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

4 (Pages 10 to 13)

and Marketing?  A. I was a business manager.  Q. How long were you with Acosta?  A. For three years.  Q. And before Acosta, where did you work?  A. I worked for Albertsons.  Q. Is that Albertsons, Inc.?  A. The original Albertsons, yes.  Q. The original. We'll call them the  original then. What did you do with the original Albertsons?  A. A variety of positions, ending with  sourcing manager.  Q. How long were you the a sourcing  manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months.  Q. And before that, what did you do?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. A warehouse  buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  D. C. So you had the opportunity to Minneapolis but decided to stay here?  Minneapolis but decided to stay here?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And when you rejoined Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there?  MR. MURRAY: Object to the form question, "rejoined."  MS. CRABTREE: Agreed.  Q. By MS. CRABTREE: When y Albertsons LLC, what's your position w Albertsons LLC, what's your position w Albertsons LLC, what's your position w Albertsons LLC.  A. Private label merchandiser.  Q. And what does that mean?  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  Q. And when you were with the o Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. Store director.  A. Only from the aspect of when the appect of when the spect	have you of the
A. I was a business manager.  A. I was a business manager.  A. How long were you with Acosta?  A. For three years.  Q. And before Acosta, where did you work?  A. I worked for Albertsons.  Q. Is that Albertsons, Inc.?  A. The original Albertsons, yes.  Q. The original. We'll call them the original then. What did you do with the original Albertsons?  A. A variety of positions, ending with sourcing manager.  Q. How long were you the a sourcing manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months.  Q. And before that, what did you do?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. About five years.  A. I was a business manager.  A. Yes.  A. Yes.  A. Yes.  A. Yes.  A. Yes.  A. Yes.  A. Was MURRAY: Object to the form question, "rejoined."  MR. MURRAY: Object to the form question, "rejoined."  A. Supression Malbertsons and Albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC?  A. Private label merchandiser.  Q. And what does that mean?  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  Q. And when you were with the oallers and the complex of the products and the complex of th	have you of the
A. I was a business manager.  Q. How long were you with Acosta?  A. For three years. Q. And before Acosta, where did you work? A. I worked for Albertsons. Q. Is that Albertsons, Inc.? A. The original Albertsons, yes. Q. The original. We'll call them the original then. What did you do with the original Albertsons? A. A variety of positions, ending with sourcing manager. A. A bout 13 months. Q. And before that, what did you do? A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. A. About five years.  A. A vaniety of positions. A warehouse buyer in Phoenix? A. A bout five years.  A. A bout 6 fore that?  A. A bout 6 fore that?  A. A private label merchandiser. Q. And when you rejoined. A. About 6 fore that?  A. Yes. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. Yes. A. A valetto in 2010, what position held there? A. A labertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position meld there? A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there? A. Avariety of positions, ending wuth the original A. Abertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC? A. Private label merchandiser. A. Private label merchandiser. A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products. A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products. A. It does. A. It doe	of the
A. For three years.  Q. And before Acosta, where did you work?  A. I worked for Albertsons.  Q. Is that Albertsons, Inc.?  A. The original Albertsons, yes.  Q. The original. We'll call them the original Albertsons?  A. A variety of positions, ending with Albertsons LLC?  A. A variety of positions, ending with Sourcing manager.  A. A bout 13 months.  A. A bout 13 months.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. About five years.  A. A bout five years.  A. A conducts?  A. A bout five years.  A. A conducts?  A. A conducts?  A. A conducts?  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix?  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. A conducts?  A. A conducts?  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. A conducts?  A. Buyer in Phoenix?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Buyer in Phoenix in Arizona.  A. Buyer in Ph	of the
Q. And before Acosta, where did you work? A. I worked for Albertsons. Q. Is that Albertsons, Inc.? A. The original Albertsons, yes. Q. The original. We'll call them the original then. What did you do with the original A. A variety of positions, ending with sourcing manager. Q. How long were you the a sourcing manager with Albertsons? A. A bout 13 months. Q. And before that, what did you do? A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. A. About five years.  A. And before that?  A. And before that?  A. And before that?  A. And before that?  A. And before Albertsons. A. Albertsons LLC in 2010, what position held there?  MR. MURRAY: Object to the form question, "rejoined."  A. Albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC?  A. Private label merchandiser. Q. And what does that mean? A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products. Q. Does that include eggs and egg products? A. It does. Q. And when you were with the one allowed and with eggs and egg products? A. About five years.	of the
A. I worked for Albertsons.  A. I worked for Albertsons.  Q. Is that Albertsons, Inc.?  A. The original Albertsons, yes.  Q. The original. We'll call them the original then. What did you do with the original Albertsons?  A. A variety of positions, ending with sourcing manager.  Q. How long were you the a sourcing manager with Albertsons?  A. A bout 13 months.  Q. And before that, what did you do?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  A. I worked for Albertsons.  A. I war War. Albertson LLC; what's your position was Albertsons LLC?  A. Private label merchandiser.  Q. And what does that mean?  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  Q. And when you were with the oall warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.	of the
7 Q. Is that Albertsons, Inc.?  8 A. The original Albertsons, yes.  9 Q. The original. We'll call them the 10 original then. What did you do with the original 11 Albertsons? 12 A. A variety of positions, ending with 13 sourcing manager. 14 Q. How long were you the a sourcing 15 manager with Albertsons? 16 A. About 13 months. 17 Q. And before that, what did you do? 18 A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. 20 Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix? 21 A. About five years. 21 Products? 22 A. About five years. 23 In Hend ther? 24 MR. MURRAY: Object to the form question, "rejoined." 25 MR. MURRAY: Object to the form question, "rejoined." 26 A. Avariety of positions, yes. 27 A. Private label merchandiser. 28 A. Private label merchandiser. 29 A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products. 20 Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer and the products? 21 A. It does. 22 A. About five years. 23 A. About five years. 24 A. About five years. 25 A. About five years. 26 A. About five years. 27 Products? 28 A. About five years. 29 A. About five years.	ou started with
A. The original Albertsons, yes.  Q. The original. We'll call them the original then. What did you do with the original A. A variety of positions, ending with A. A variety of positions, ending with Sourcing manager.  A. A variety of positions, ending with Sourcing manager.  A. A bout 13 months.  A. A bout 13 months.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. A bout five years.  A. A bout five years.  A. A bout five years.  B. WR. CRABTREE: When y question, "rejoined."  A. B. Was CRABTREE: When y Albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC?  A. Albertsons LLC?  A. Albertsons LLC?  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  B. CRABTREE: When y Albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC?  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  C. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  A. It does.  A. About five years.  A. A private label merchandiser.  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. D. And what does that mean?  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. It does.  A. It does.  A. Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. About five years.	ou started with
9 Q. The original. We'll call them the 10 original then. What did you do with the original 11 Albertsons? 12 A. A variety of positions, ending with 13 sourcing manager. 14 Q. How long were you the a sourcing 15 manager with Albertsons? 16 A. About 13 months. 17 Q. And before that, what did you do? 18 A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. 20 Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer 21 in Phoenix? 22 A. About five years. 29 A. About five years. 20 A. About five years. 20 Q. And before that? 20 A. About five years. 21 Q. And before that? 21 products? 22 A. About five years. 29 MS. CRABTREE: Agreed. 20 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Agreed. 20 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Agreed. 20 A. Abert's your position was Albertsons LLC? 21 A. Private label merchandiser. 22 A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products. 23 Q. Does that include eggs and egg products? 24 A. It does. 25 A. About five years. 26 A. About five years. 27 A. It does. 28 A. About five years. 29 A. About five years. 20 A. About five years. 20 A. About five years. 21 products? 22 A. About five years. 23 Products? 24 A. It does. 25 A. It does. 26 A. It does. 27 A. It does. 28 A. It does. 29 A. It does. 20 And when you were with the one Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and eg	
original then. What did you do with the original  Albertsons?  A. A variety of positions, ending with sourcing manager.  A. Abwariety of positions, ending with manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. About the original  A. By MS. CRABTREE: When y Albertsons LLC; Albertsons LLC; Albertsons LLC; A. Albertsons LLC; A. Albertsons LLC; A. Albertsons LLC; A. Private label merchandiser. A. Private label merchandiser. A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  A. Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  A. It	
original then. What did you do with the original Albertsons?  A. A variety of positions, ending with sourcing manager.  A. How long were you the a sourcing manager with Albertsons?  A. A bout 13 months.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  D. And before that?  D. BY MS. CRABTREE: When you have regional Albertsons LLC?  Albertsons LLC?  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  D. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  A. It does.  A. It does.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  D. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.	
Albertsons?  A. A variety of positions, ending with sourcing manager.  Q. How long were you the a sourcing manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. A variety of positions, ending with albertsons LLC, what's your position was Albertsons LLC, was Albertsons LL	ii+h
A. A variety of positions, ending with  sourcing manager.  Q. How long were you the a sourcing  manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. A variety of positions, ending with  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. A bout five products.  A. A bout five products.  A. A bout five products.  A. It does.	TUT
sourcing manager.  Q. How long were you the a sourcing manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months.  Q. And before that, what did you do?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. Private label merchandiser.  Q. And what does that mean?  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  A. It does.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. Private label merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandiser.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  A. It does.  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  A. Buyer in Phoenix appears and egg products?  A. It does.	
Q. How long were you the a sourcing manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months. Q. And before that, what did you do? A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix? A. About five years.  14 Q. And what does that mean? A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  16 products. Q. Does that include eggs and egg products? A. It does.  20 A. It does. 21 Q. And when you were with the output A. About five years.  11 Products? A. About five years.  11 products?	
manager with Albertsons?  A. About 13 months.  Q. And before that, what did you do?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. A warehouse buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. Buyer in Phoenix?  A. It does.  A. It does.  A. About five years.  15  A. I'm responsible for the sales merchandising aspects of all private products.  16  Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  20  A. It does.  21  Q. And when you were with the output Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. About five years.  11  Q. And before that?  12  Discrepance of all private products.  A. It does.  21  Q. And when you were with the output products?  A. It does.  22  Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. It does.	
A. About 13 months.  Q. And before that, what did you do?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. A warehouse buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  16 merchandising aspects of all private products.  Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  Q. And when you were with the of Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. About five years.  11  Q. And before that?  1 products?	and
17 Q. And before that, what did you do?  18 A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. A warehouse  19 buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  20 Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer  21 in Phoenix?  22 A. About five years.  17 products.  18 Q. Does that include eggs and egg products?  20 A. It does.  21 Q. And when you were with the of Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and and albertsons, did you deal with eggs and albertsons.  11  1 Q. And before that?  1 products?	label
A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona. A warehouse buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. And before that?  A. Buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Products?  A. It does.  A. Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  A. About five years.  D. Does that include eggs and egg products?  A. It does.  Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and egg products?	
buyer in Phoenix, Arizona.  Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  In Phoenix?  A. About five years.  19 products?  A. It does.  11 Q. And when you were with the one Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and Albertsons.	g
Q. And how long were you a warehouse buyer in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  Q. And when you were with the one Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and Albertsons.	
in Phoenix?  A. About five years.  21 Q. And when you were with the o 22 Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and 23 Albertsons, did you deal with eggs and 24 Products?  11 products?	
11  1 Q. And before that?  1 products?	riginal
11  1 Q. And before that?  1 products?	egg
<sup>1</sup> Q. And before that? <sup>1</sup> products?	
Q. And before that?	13
, and the same of	
	en I was a
<sup>3</sup> Q. How long were you a store director? <sup>3</sup> <b>store manager and a grocery mana</b>	
<sup>4</sup> A. About three years. <sup>4</sup> products in our stores.	<b>3</b> ,
5 Q. And before that? 5 Q. Were you ever responsible for	r sourcina
6 A. Grocery manager, about four years. 6 eggs and egg products?	o o
<sup>7</sup> Q. Before that? <sup>7</sup> A. Not with the original Alberts	sons.
8 A. Grocery clerk. 8 Q. But you are with the current?	
9 Q. So you you started there, right? 9 A. I am today, yes.	
<sup>10</sup> <b>A. Yeah. I I started as a bagger.</b> <sup>10</sup> Q. Okay. How many grocery sto	res does
So Albertsons LLC own?	<del>-</del>
<sup>12</sup> Q. Okay. And when did you start with the <sup>12</sup> MR. MURRAY: Objection. You'v	
13 original Albertsons? 13 time limit on that because it's change	e got to but a
<sup>14</sup> A. 1986. <sup>14</sup> significantly.	
<sup>15</sup> Q. And you were there until 2007? <sup>15</sup> Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Okay.	
16 A. Correct. 16 2010, how many grocery stores did A	b
<sup>17</sup> Q. And why did you leave? <sup>17</sup> own?	Starting in
18 A. SUPERVALU purchased the original 18 A. At that time, it was about 22	Starting in
19 Albertsons and they were moving my job function to 19 Q. What about currently?	Starting in
Minneapolis.  20 A. The Albertsons LLC that we	Starting in
21 Q. And 21 about operates 192 stores. In Marc	Starting in libertsons LLC
22 A. I wanted to stay here. 22 we purchased a large block of stor	Starting in Ibertsons LLC
we purchased a large block of stor	Starting in Ibertsons LLC  Starting in Ibertsons LLC  Starting Ibertsons LLC  Starting Ibertsons LLC  Starting Ibertsons LLC

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

#### Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

5 (Pages 14 to 17)

14 16 SUPERVALU. And so all told between both Q. For what time period is Albertsons LLC organizations we are around 1,060. claiming that it purchased eggs and egg products Q. And the stores that you bought in for which it's seeking damages in this suit? March, were those stores that the original MR. MURRAY: Object to the form of the Albertsons had control over? question to the extent it calls for a legal A. Prior to 2006, correct. conclusion. Q. So prior to 2006, how many stores did THE WITNESS: I -- I'm not really sure. the original Albertsons own? I'd have to . . . A. Including drugstores and -- and fuel Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: So Albertsons LLC has 10 kiosks and everything, I believe the number was 10 existed since 2006: is that correct? 11 11 around 2,500. 12 12 Q. Okay. So the number of stores Q. And has it been purchasing eggs and egg 13 13 Albertsons LLC now owns is about half of what the products since 2006? 14 original Albertsons owned before SUPERVALU bought 14 A. Yes. 15 some? Q. But Albertsons LLC didn't exist before 16 A. That would be accurate. 16 2006, correct? 17 17 Q. Got it. A. Correct. 18 With Albertsons LLC, what types of Q. So it couldn't have bought eggs and egg 19 19 eggs and egg products does Albertsons LLC products prior to that period? 20 20 purchase? A. Correct. A. We purchase shell -- fresh shell eggs; Q. Okay. I'm going to go ahead and show 22 22 we purchase specialty eggs; we purchase liquid you what we've marked as exhibit -- Albertsons 15 17 eggs; and we purchase frozen liquid eggs. Exhibit 1. Q. Frozen liquid? (Albertsons Exhibit 1 marked.) A. Yeah. MR. MURRAY: Thank you. Q. Let me back up one second. Wait a minute. You might want to look A. Sure. through this. It's got some --Q. The -- the footprint of Albertsons LLC MS. CRABTREE: Oh, it's got a fax on it, since March, what would be the geographic doesn't it. footprint of the current LLC? MR. MURRAY: -- some notes. And so I didn't A. I think we operate in about 18 look at what anything is written there --10 different states. We have the -- pretty much MS. CRABTREE: That's a fax cover sheet. 11 the entire western half of the United States, 11 MR. MURRAY: -- wrote -- whatever. This --12 12 running across the southern half, and then we maybe you might want to check the one that the 13 have Jewel, Acme, and Shaw's in the Midwest and witness has marked too before you . . . 14 Northeast. 14 MS. CRABTREE: Um-hmm. 15 15 Q. That was going to be my next question. MR. HUTCHINSON: Have we taken a roll call 16 16 What -- what are the different names of the yet? I just got on a little late. 17 17 grocery stores that Albertsons LLC currently MS. CRABTREE: Hi, Troy. We did, but you runs? can appear now if you want. Go ahead. 19 19 A. We have the Albertsons banner, the MR. HUTCHINSON: Okay. This is Troy 20 Lucky banner, Super Saver banner, Jewel-Osco 20 Hutchinson on behalf of Sparboe Farms. 21 banner, Acme banner, Shaw's banner, and Star MS. CRABTREE: I think it went though. Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Ready? banner.

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

6 (Pages 18 to 21)

	10	20
	18	
1	A. I believe so.	A. Mark Klewin is our procurement manager
2	Q. Do you recognize Exhibit 1?	in the Phoenix distribution center.
3	A. I do.	Q. And the last name was Mike Nosal?
4	Q. And Exhibit 1 is a 30(b)(6) notice to	4 A. Marc Nosal.
	lbertsons LLC. Do you understand that you've	<sup>5</sup> Q. Oh, Marc Nosal.
	een designated to speak on behalf of Albertsons	<sup>6</sup> A. Yep.
	LC for the topics in this notice?	<sup>7</sup> Q. I keep getting my Mikes and Marks
8	A. Yes, ma'am.	8 A. Marc Nosal is the sourcing manager for
9	<ul> <li>Q. And are you prepared to speak to all of</li> </ul>	<sup>9</sup> SUPERVALU.
<sup>10</sup> th	ne topics in this notice?	Q. And was did you speak to each of
11	A. Yes, ma'am.	these gentlemen individually or as a group?
12	Q. What did you do to prepare for your	A. Three of them were in were in a
<sup>13</sup> de	eposition today?	group phone call and the other were individual.
14	A. Talked with a a few individuals that	Q. So Spiller who was in the group
<sup>15</sup> ha	ad knowledge of eggs and egg procurement,	phone call?
<sup>16</sup> S0	ourcing, negotiations, and did a little bit of	A. The three from the southwest
<sup>17</sup> re	esearch on sales quantities and	division Mike Spiller, Tim Puckett, and
18	Q. Who were the individuals you spoke	<sup>18</sup> Tim Ryan.
<sup>19</sup> W	rith?	<sup>19</sup> Q. And you mentioned that Tim Ryan and
20	A. Mike Spiller, Tim Puckett, Tim Ryan,	Tim Puckett were both category managers. What
<sup>21</sup> <b>M</b>	lark Klewin, Marc Nosal.	category are they assigned to?
22	Q. And what are their positions	A. Tim Ryan is in charge of the dairy
	19	21
<sup>1</sup> ir	n Albertsons are those all Albertsons LLC	¹ category.
<sup>2</sup> e	mployees?	<sup>2</sup> Q. And Mr. Puckett?
3	A. They are not.	<sup>3</sup> A. And Tim Puckett is in charge of the
4	Q. Who who are they? Let's start with	4 frozen category.
5 <b>N</b>	flike Spiller.	<sup>5</sup> Q. And what did you discuss on that phone
6	A. Mike Spiller is a private label	6 call?
7 <b>m</b>	nerchandiser in the southwest division.	7 A. I tried to get a deeper understanding
8	Q. With Albertsons?	8 for the merchandising aspects at store level with
9	A. With Albertsons LLC, yes.	<sup>9</sup> regards to eggs and egg products.
10	Q. And Tim Puckett?	Q. When you say "merchandising," do you
11	A. Tim Puckett is a category manager in	mean retail sale?
<sup>12</sup> ti	he southwest division for Albertsons LLC.	A. Yeah. Retail all the retail sales
13	Q. I believe the next name was Tim Ryan?	13 functions.
14	A. Tim Ryan is a category manager in the	Q. Do any of the gentlemen on that phone
<sup>15</sup> S	outhwest division for Albertsons LLC.	have responsibility for choosing an egg supplier?
16	Q. I missed the next one. Was it Mike	16 A. They do not.
17	MR. MURRAY: Mark.	Q. Who at Albertsons makes a final
18	MS. CRABTREE: Pardon? McKlewin?	decision on who you purchase eggs and egg products
19	THE WITNESS: Mark Klewin.	19 from?
20	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Mark Klewin.	MR. MURRAY: When you're referring to
21	A. Um-hum.	21 Albertsons, now you're referring to the LLC?
22	Q. And who is Mark Klewin?	MS. CRABTREE: The LLC.
	Q. THICK WHO IS WAIK NICWIT!	MO. OTABINEE. THE LEO.
<u> </u>		<u> </u>

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

7 (Pages 22 to 25)

			7 (1 ages 22 to 25)
	22		24
1	MR. MURRAY: Okay. Why don't we say that	1 <b>C</b>	al-Maine, Zephyr, Sparboe, Hickman's, and Rocky
2	you'll the term "Albertsons" will refer to the	<sup>2</sup> M	lountain Eggs.
3	LLC unless otherwise	3	Q. And that's of 2006?
4	MS. CRABTREE: The old Albertsons or	4	A. That was yeah, during
5	original Albertsons I'll clarify for time	5	Q. Okay. So let's take it
6	purposes. Right now, we're just talking about	6	A that time frame.
7	Albertsons LLC.	7	Q. Year by year.
8	THE WITNESS: Okay. Okay.	8	A. Okay.
9	I'm the one responsible for making	9	Q. So that's 2006. Who what about
10	those decisions.	<sup>10</sup> 20	007?
11	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: And what was your	11	A. So in 2007, we would have been doing
12	conversation with Mark Klewin about?	<sup>12</sup> <b>b</b> i	usiness with pretty much all of those same
13	A. In speaking with Mark Klewin, I tried		uppliers.
14	to get a better understanding of the actual	14	Q. And 2008?
15	procurement process, the buying process from the	15	A. 2008, we would have sold off the piece
16	egg supplier to the distribution center to the	<sup>16</sup> <b>o</b> f	f business that was supplied by NuCal.
17	stores.	17	Q. But otherwise oh, go ahead.
18	Q. And your conversation with Marc Nosal?	18	A. Otherwise, everybody else we still did
19	A. Marc Nosal is the sourcing manager for	<sup>19</sup> <b>b</b> ı	usiness with.
20	SUPERVALU. So when I spoke with him, I was trying	20	Q. In 2009?
21	to get a better understanding of how the egg	21	A. 2009, I believe that was the
22	supplier sourcing decisions were made from 2006	<sup>22</sup> aı	pproximate time that Cal-Maine acquired Zephyr
	23		25
1	until 2010	1 <b>H</b> i	Ils. So it would have consolidated that piece
2	Q. And would those be		business.
3	A when I came on board.	3	Q. But you continued to
4	Q. Okay. So did Mr. Nosal used to work	4	A. Buy from Cal-Maine.
5	for Albertsons LLC?	5	Q. So your volume would have been the
6	A. He did not. He worked for SUPERVALU.	6 sa	me, but it would have come through Cal-Maine
7	Q. Okay.		stead of Zephyr?
8	A. So	8	A. (Witness nods head.)
9	Q. So from 2006 to 2010, who was in charge	9	Q. What about 2010?
10	of procuring eggs and egg products for Albertsons	10	A. 2010 would have been the same same
11	LLC?	<sup>11</sup> gr	oup of suppliers.
12	A. Marc Nosal and SUPERVALU managed that	12	Q. 2011?
13	process as part of a transitional service	13	A. 2011, we made some supply changes. We
14	agreement between SUPERVALU and Albertsons LLC.	<sup>14</sup> eli	iminated Sparboe Farms and Moark.
15	Q. From 2006 to or to currently, who	15	Q. 2012?
16	does Albertsons purchase shell eggs from?	16	A. 2012 would have been Hickman's,
17	A. We have several different suppliers	17 RC	ocky Mountain Eggs, Cal-Maine, and that would be
18	in in different parts of the country. In 2006,	<sup>18</sup> it.	
19	we had locations open at that point that we do not	19	Q. And 2013, I take it is going to be two
20	have open any longer. So there were there were	<sup>20</sup> pie	eces
21	several suppliers that we did business with then	21	A. Yeah.
22	that we don't do now. NuCal Farms, Moark,	22	Q so let's say preacquisition.
	· · ·		• • •

Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

8 (Pages 26 to 29)

26	28
<sup>1</sup> A. Preacquisition is Hickman's, Rocky	<sup>1</sup> A. And that is that was ConAgra at
Mountain Eggs, Cal-Maine. Postacquisition is	A. And that is that was comagna at
Mountain Eggs, cal-maine. Tostacquisition is	that in the carry years. In 2011, we switched
going to be those three plus there's a	ironi conagra to inichaer i oods for our fiquid eg
lifere 3 a barren of new suppliers, and this sorry, i	products.
do not I do not know those all by memory.	Q. And do you still purchase from Michael
Q. What products were you purchasing from	1 oous today!
NuGai 110111 2000 to 2000 !	A. We do.
A. Sileli just sileli eggs. Allu tilat	<ul> <li>Q. Do you require that your liquid eggs be</li> <li>UEP certified?</li> </ul>
would include both commodity eggs and specialty	OLI Certined:
eggs.	A. Tuo not know.
Q. What do you consider specially eggs?	Q. Do you know it they are:
A. Anything that has a health benefit	A. Do i know ii tiley are:
ciaiiii of like a free-range, cage-free aspect to	Q. If they are:
IC.	A. I do not know.
Q. Were you buying OLI Certified eggs from	Q. Where would you go to find that out:
NuCai:	A. I could look at a package of feler to
A. 165.	the contract.
Q. Was that a requirement for the eggs	Q. Did you look at any documents to
that you were purchasing?	prepare for today?
A. Yes.	<sup>20</sup> A. I did.
Q. Why did you require UEP certified	Q. Did you look at any of the contracts
eggs?	you have with these suppliers?
27	29
<sup>1</sup> A. The requirement for UEP certified eggs	<sup>1</sup> A. I looked at the ones for the shell
preexisted, so as we moved the business forward,	eggs. I did I did not look at the contract for
we kept it consistent and kept that requirement in	the liquid eggs. SUPERVALU owns that contract
<sup>4</sup> place. Just to, I guess, keep the program	and I just didn't think to grab that.
5 consistent, keep the shopping experience	5 Q. Do you know if that if the ConAgra
6 consistent for our customers.	and Michael contracts have been produced in this
Q. Do you still require UEP certified	<sup>7</sup> case?
8 eggs?	8 A. I do not know.
<sup>9</sup> A. We do.	<sup>9</sup> Q. How about Zephyr? What were you
<sup>10</sup> Q. What about Moark? What were you	purchasing from Zephyr up until the point
purchasing from Moark from 2006 to 2011?	<sup>11</sup> Cal-Maine purchased them?
A. Shell eggs, to include commodity and	<sup>12</sup> A. Shell eggs, to include commodity and
specialty eggs.	specialty.
<sup>14</sup> Q. No egg products?	Q. And Sparboe Farms from 2006 to 2011?
<sup>15</sup> A. Not from Moark.	<sup>15</sup> A. Shell eggs, commodity and specialty.
<sup>16</sup> Q. Okay. How about Cal-Maine? What	Q. Why did you stop purchasing eggs from
have you purchased from Cal-Maine from 2006 to	<sup>17</sup> Moark in 2011?
present?	<sup>18</sup> A. We put the egg supply contracts out to
<sup>19</sup> A. Shell eggs, to include commodity and	bid and found a supplier that could do it at a
specialty. I'm sorry, I I did neglect to	20 better price for us.
21 mention the supplier for the liquid eggs.	Q. Who is that supplier?
<sup>22</sup> Q. Okay.	A. Hickman's.
<u> </u>	

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

9 (Pages 30 to 33)

	1		7 (1 uges 30 to 33)
	30		32
1	Q. That's who took over the Moark	1	Q. Do you know if anyone at Albertsons
2	business?	2	did?
3	A. The Moark business.	3	A. Not that I'm aware of.
4	Q. And why did you stop purchasing eggs	4	Q. So why did you make the ultimate
5	from Sparboe in 2011?	5	decision to move away from Sparboe in 2011?
6	A. In 2011, Sparboe Farms had an animal	6	A. We thought it was safer, I guess, from
7	mistreatment expose that was on the news or and	7	a from a consumer perception perspective.
8	so that prompted a a supply change.	8	Q. Did you hear from any animal rights
9	Q. How did you become aware of that	9	groups after that TV special?
10	publicity from that Sparboe received in 2011?	10	A. I did not.
11	A. We got an E-mail from Sparboe	11	Q. Was Albertsons ever identified with
12	indicating that it was going to play on television	12	that TV special or named as one of Sparboe's
13	and then saw the actual television program as	13	clients?
14	well.	14	A. I don't believe so.
15	Q. Who received the E-mail from Sparboe?	15	Q. Who took over that Sparboe business?
16	A. I did.	16	A. Hickman's.
17	Q. Who sent it to you?	17	Q. Did you put it out to bid?
18	A. I believe it was David Collie from	18	A. I did not.
19	Sparboe Farms.	19	Q. How did you determine what price
20	•	20	Hickman's would sell eggs in that area that was
21	Q. Do you know how to spell his last name?  A. C-o-I-I-i-e.	21	a terrible question.
22	Q. And when you received that E-mail, you	22	If you didn't put it out to bid, how
	Q. And when you received that E-mail, you		ii you didii i pat ii oat to bia, iio ii
	31		33
1	then watched the television program?	1	did you determine the price that Hickman's would
2	A. Yes.	2	charge?
3	Q. And then what did you do?	3	A. We were already doing business with
4	A. And then we started talking with the	4	Hickman's in the Arizona and New Mexico markets,
5	division that's responsible for those stores to	5	so we utilized the same formula for pricing to
6	-		determine the Colorado pricing.
7	get their thoughts on whether or not we needed to make a supply change.	7	Q. Did the pricing from Hickman's differ
8	Q. And what division was that?	8	at all from the Sparboe pricing?
9	A. That was the southwest division.	9	A. It did.
10		10	
11	<ul><li>Q. And who did you speak with about that?</li><li>A. Quite a variety of folks within the</li></ul>	11	Q. Was it more or less?  A. It was more.
12	-	12	Q. And Hickman's was required to provide
13	merchandising department.	13	·
14	Q. Do you remember any in particular?	14	UEP certified eggs?  A. Yes.
15	A. I know we talked to Tim Ryan, and I think we talked with Ken Diehl.	15	A. Yes.     Q. Have you ever entertained a bid from a
16		16	· ·
17	Q. What does Mr. Diehl do?	17	non-UEP certified company?
18	A. At that time, he was the vice president		A. No, I haven't entertained a bid from
19	of marketing and merchandising in the southwest	19	one. A current supplier has offered non-UEP
20	division.	20	certified eggs, but we elected to stick with UEP
20	Q. Did you hear from any of your customers	21	certified.
22	after the TV special ran?	22	Q. And who was that supplier?
	A. I did not.		A. Hidden Villa Ranch.

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

10 (Pages 34 to 37)

1 Q. What do you purchase from Hidden Villa? 2 A. Shell eggs and specialty eggs. 3 Q. For what time periods have you been purchasing from Hidden Villa? 4 purchasing from Hidden Villa? 5 A. They are one of the brand new they are a supplier in one of the brand new divisions that we just acquired in March. 6 Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs? 10 A. They do. 11 A. About two cents a dozen. 12 Q. What do you purchase from Hidden Villa? 2 Q. So you're not using it as an ingredic in anything? 4 A. No. No. 5 Q. Do you purchase any dried eggs? 6 A. Not that I'm aware of. 7 Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over. 10 (Albertsons Exhibit 2 marked.) 11 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a document to look this over. 12 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a document to look this over. 13 A. About two cents a dozen.	nt
A. Shell eggs and specialty eggs.  Q. For what time periods have you been purchasing from Hidden Villa?  A. They are one of the brand new they are a supplier in one of the brand new divisions that we just acquired in March. Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. They do.  Q. So you're not using it as an ingredic in anything?  A. No. No. Q. Do you purchase any dried eggs? A. Not that I'm aware of. Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do. Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	nt
Q. For what time periods have you been purchasing from Hidden Villa?  A. They are one of the brand new they are a supplier in one of the brand new divisions that we just acquired in March. Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. Not that I'm aware of. Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do. Q. Do you remember by how much?  In anything?  A. No. No. Q. Do you purchase any dried eggs?  A. Not that I'm aware of. Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  In (Albertsons Exhibit 2 marked.) Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doctor.	
purchasing from Hidden Villa?  A. They are one of the brand new they are a supplier in one of the brand new divisions that we just acquired in March.  Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. No. No.  A. No No.  A. No No.  A. Not that I'm aware of.  Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do.  Q. Do you purchase any dried eggs?  A. Not that I'm aware of.  Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do.  Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	
A. They are one of the brand new they are a supplier in one of the brand new divisions that we just acquired in March.  Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. Not that I'm aware of.  Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do.  Q. Do you purchase any dried eggs?  A. Not that I'm aware of.  Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do.  Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	
are a supplier in one of the brand new divisions that we just acquired in March.  Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. Not that I'm aware of.  Q. I'm going to show you what has bee marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do.  Q. Do you remember by how much?  A. Not that I'm aware of.  A. Hot that I'm aware of.  A. Not that I'm aware of.  A. I'm going to show you what has bee marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this take moment to look this over.  A. They do.  Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	
that we just acquired in March.  Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. They do.  Q. I'm going to show you what has been marked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  (Albertsons Exhibit 2 marked.)  Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a document to look this over.	
Q. And were the non-UEP certified eggs that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. They do.  Q. Do you remember by how much?  Begin arked or what will be marked as Exhibit you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  (Albertsons Exhibit 2 marked.) Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	n
that Hidden Villa offered you, did they cost less than the UEP certified eggs?  A. They do.  Q. Do you remember by how much?  you could take a moment to look this take moment to look this over.  (Albertsons Exhibit 2 marked.)  Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	
than the UEP certified eggs?  A. They do.  Q. Do you remember by how much?  than the UEP certified eggs?  (Albertsons Exhibit 2 marked.)  Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	
11 A. They do. 12 Q. Do you remember by how much? 11 (Albertsons Exhibit 2 marked.) 12 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	
Q. Do you remember by how much? Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: This is a doc	
	ument
II I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	
Q. And you decided not to purchase the Supplemental Responses to Defendants' Fi	
non-UEP certified eggs?  15 Interrogatories." And I'll tell you most of my	
16 A. Correct. 16 questions are going to be about Exhibit A.	
Q. What area does Hidden Villa service?	
18 A. Southern California. 18 A. Okay. Okay.	
Q. Do you know about how many stores they  Q. Do you know about how many stores they	
20 service? 20 A. I do.	
21 A. 196? Q. Do you know how Exhibit A was cre	ated?
22 Q. What products have you purchased from 22 A. All I know about it is that it was	
35	37
<sup>1</sup> Hickman's from 2006 to present? <sup>1</sup> created by the lawyers. They took doc	uments
<sup>2</sup> A. Shell eggs, both commodity and <sup>2</sup> from they took documents that we h	
<sup>3</sup> specialty. <sup>3</sup> over and created the the exhibit.	
4 Q. And Rocky Mountain? 4 Q. To your knowledge, did anyone a	ıt
5 A. Shell eggs, both commodity and 5 Albertsons check the accuracy of Exhibit	
6 specialty. 6 A. Not to my knowledge.	
<sup>7</sup> Q. Who do you purchase your frozen eggs <sup>7</sup> Q. So do you know, sitting here toda	ıv.
8 from? 8 whether Exhibit A is, in fact, accurate?	-y 1
9 A. I I do not know. 9 A. I'm not really sure. I would have	e to
<sup>10</sup> Q. Where would you go to find that <sup>10</sup> see the source documents to be able to	
information?	- p 1. wo
12 A. I would check with one of the	
distribution centers to see who the vendor is for start with page 1.	
those products.  14 A. Um-hum.	
<sup>15</sup> Q. Do you know if it's just one vendor or <sup>15</sup> Q. And you see there the first exhibit	t is
multiple?  16 a date range, then Plaintiff, then Supplier	
A. It's just one vendor. It's it's a Product, and Pricing/Terms. And the firs	•
single just a one-item category. It's very  18 indicates, under Pricing and Terms, ".202	
19 small. 19 Do you know what that means?	
<sup>20</sup> Q. What do you do with the frozen liquid <sup>20</sup> MR. MURRAY: Are you looking at the	is page?
that you purchase?  21 that you purchase?  21 THE WITNESS: Yeah.	- 6~90.
22 A. It is it's in a retail customer-	
I is to the first of the first	

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

11 (Pages 38 to 41)

20	40
38	40
<sup>1</sup> THE WITNESS: Yeah, I I do not know	Terms, ".47 unit cost, Urner Barry Market." Do
offhand. I mean I'm not sure what that is. I	you know what that means?
would have to see the the source document.	A. I'm not 100 percent sure without seeing
<sup>4</sup> Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Do you purchase eggs	the the source document.
<sup>5</sup> from Cal-Maine on based off of an Urner Barry	<sup>5</sup> Q. Let's go ahead and look at one of
<sup>6</sup> quote?	<sup>6</sup> those.
<sup>7</sup> A. We do.	MS. CRABTREE: Let's mark Exhibit 3.
<sup>8</sup> Q. Do you ever purchase off of a cost	8 (Albertsons Exhibit 3 marked.)
9 plus?	<sup>9</sup> Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: And Exhibit 3 if
A. Not that I'm aware of.	you'll excuse my handwritten Bates on the
<sup>11</sup> Q. Okay. For all of your shell egg	bottom it was an Excel spreadsheet. It's
purchases, do you use Urner Barry for pricing?	ALBEG 16. And if you turn to page 6 of Exhibit A,
A. For all of our commodity egg purchases,	and it's in 16 through 27. Okay.
<sup>14</sup> yes.	Well, first of all, can you tell me
<sup>15</sup> Q. What about for specialty eggs?	<sup>15</sup> what Exhibit 3 is?
A. Specialty eggs are those are	A. It's a promotional offer form.
supplier-directed prices.	Q. And when does Albertsons use
<sup>18</sup> Q. And if you look further down that first	promotional offer forms?
page, four lines up from the bottom well,	<sup>19</sup> A. When a supplier is offering allowances
another question first. Do you see the date range	or or promotional monies to be used for
for that first entry is January 28th, 2005?	discounting products.
<sup>22</sup> A. Um-hum.	Q. And how does that work?
<ul> <li>Q. Did Albertsons LLC exist in 2005?</li> <li>A. We did not.</li> <li>Q. Do you know why you would have data</li> <li>going back to 2005?</li> </ul>	A. A supplier if a supplier wants to  sell more of a specific product, they'll give us  money off of the case cost or against scan  movement to discount, promote, advertise, display
<sup>5</sup> A. That's probably data from the original	5 their products during a specific window.
<sup>6</sup> Albertsons.	<sup>6</sup> Q. So that would be an additional discount
Q. So purchases from 2005 would not be	that you'd have your price based off of the Urner
purchases that Albertsons LLC made, correct?	<sup>8</sup> Barry, correct?
<sup>9</sup> A. That's correct.	<sup>9</sup> A. Um-hum.
Q. And if you see four lines up from the	Q. And is that price always some amount
bottom, there's an entry for Michael Foods?	less than the Urner Barry market?
12 A. Um-hum.	A. A promotional allowance would be a
<sup>13</sup> Q. It says "Liquid Egg White"?	discount off of whatever the established price for
<sup>14</sup> A. Um-hum.	that time frame was, yeah.
Q. Does that refresh your recollection of	Q. Okay. So it would be additional?
who you from whom you buy liquid eggs oh,	<sup>16</sup> A. Um-hum.
you told me you bought them from Michael's,	Q. So if you had a contract that specified
18 correct?	a certain cents off the Urner Barry market and
<sup>19</sup> A. Yeah.	you were running a promotion with that supplier,
<sup>20</sup> Q. It was frozen we didn't know.	the cost you were paying for those eggs would be
A. Correct.	even less than what the contract indicated,
Q. And this indicates under Pricing and	<sup>22</sup> correct?

#### Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

12 (Pages 42 to 45)

42 44 A. Could be --Exhibit 2, just to be more confusing, you'll see Q. Okay. the last line there indicates a date of 2005 to 2006 A. -- if -- if there was a promotional And it lists the supplier as Sparboe, offer form during that time frame. Q. All right. And it looks like -- can and it looks like it lists some pricing and terms, you tell me what supplier Exhibit 3 relates to? and under Type it says "Executed Contract." And then under Source, it gives the Bates number for A. On page 1, it's from Hickman's Family this Exhibit 3. Farms. Q. Okay. And if you could go through and A. Um-hum. 10 10 confirm for me that all the pages in this exhibit Q. Does Exhibit 3 at all relate to the 11 relate to Hickman's? 2005, 2006 time frame? 12 12 A. They do not. MR. MURRAY: I -- I'm going to object. The 13 Q. Which ones do not relate to Hickman's? Bates numbers are different. There's -- there's 14 more letters in the -- it is ALBGBEGED, and the A. The last two pages are from Moark. 15 15 Q. Okay. And the last page of this is an "ED" isn't on the chart. 16 Albertsons Cost Change Form. Is this an MS. CRABTREE: Okay. 17 17 Albertsons form? MR. MURRAY: There's a -- there's a 18 18 difference in the Bates numbers. The preface to A. It is. Q. And what do you use this form for? the actual numbers is -- is different. 20 20 MS. CRABTREE: Okay. A. The cost of eggs pretty much change 21 21 every week based on whatever the Urner Barry THE WITNESS: This -- this document doesn't average is that's published. So we use this to have anything to do with that line item, no. 45 help our -- our buyers establish the correct cost Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Okay. And if you in the buying system when they make their look at Exhibit 3, it indicates the "Albertsons purchases. Promotional Offer Form," that first page? Q. So do all of your suppliers submit A. Um-hum. these cost change forms weekly? Q. How often do you receive these Promotional Offer Forms? A. Either this form or something very A. It varies. We get them -- we get them similar, yes. every day from all the different suppliers. But Q. And who receives those? A. There's a whole host of people that get specifically to eggs, it -- it varies greatly. I 10 mean, there's some that never turn anything like 11 Q. Do you receive them? 11 this in. They never promote. 12 Q. When you do get them, do you keep them 13 13 Q. Do you keep them somewhere? in any particular file? A. The merchandisers do, yes. They --14 A. I do. 14 15 Q. Where do you keep them? they're required to keep them. 16 16 A. I have electronic files for all weekly Q. Would you receive them? 17 17 cost changes. A. I would not. Q. Okay. So Exhibit 3 -- excuse me --Q. Okay. So these go directly to the 19 19 appears to relate to Hickman's and Moark, correct? merchandisers in the regions? 20 20 A. Correct. A. To the division, yes. 21 21 Q. And if you look at the very bottom of Q. And how often do you run specials on 22 page 5 of Exhibit 2 -- page 5 of Exhibit A of eggs?

Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

13 (Pages 46 to 49)

48 46 A. Very often. I would probably say two A. For the most part, it's based on to three times a month. competitive market pressure. Q. Why do you run them so often? Q. And you said that the price that you A. It's a great traffic driver, and it pay for eggs varies pretty much weekly? is a very sensitive item from a consumer A. Yes. perspective. Q. How often do you change the retail cost Q. What do you mean by "sensitive item"? based on your supplier cost? A. Consumers know and understand eggs, A. Not very often. We -- well, I take high household penetration, a lot of people use that back. With specialty eggs, we do make 10 them. So it's pretty much on everybody's 10 changes based on cost on -- on what our supplier 11 11 shopping -- shopping list every week. So it's a cost is. With commodity eggs, we base our pricing 12 good item to get the customer in. off of what the market and the competition is 13 Q. So when you run specials two to three 13 doina. 14 times a month, are -- do you ask for a lower price 14 Q. The retail market? 15 whenever you run a special from your supplier? A. The retail market, yes. A. Not always. 16 Q. So if you're paying more to your 17 Q. Do you ever sell eggs at a loss? 17 supplier for eggs, you wouldn't necessarily be 18 charging your customers more for those eggs? 19 Q. Are you familiar with the term "loss 19 A. Correct. 20 leader"? 20 Q. Is there a point at which your 21 A. Yes. commodity egg costs would increase to a point 22 Q. What does that mean? 22 where you would change the retail costs? 47 49 A. That means there -- there are some A. It's more important for us to be items that we lose money intentionally on because competitive in the retail market than it is to it's sensitive to a customer or it is a good item watch our pennies on eggs. to bring customers into the store. MS. CRABTREE: Let's go ahead and mark Exhibit 4. Q. And is eggs one of the items that you use as a loss leader? (Discussion off the record.) A. Yes. (Albertsons Exhibit 4 marked.) Q. How often are you selling eggs at a MR. MURRAY: Do you want to announce the Bates numbers for the record? loss? 10 MR. MURRAY: Object to the form of the MS. CRABTREE: Oh, yeah. It is CM489258. 11 question. It is vague. 11 THE WITNESS: Okay. 12 12 THE WITNESS: It would depend. I mean, Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Have you ever seen --13 13 the title of the document is a "Co-Pack Purchase each division is going to have different 14 merchandising and advertising philosophies and --14 Agreement," dated September 15th, 2007. Have you and timing. ever seen this document before? 16 16 A. I have not. And it depends on the competitive 17 17 market, you know, what is going on in the market. Q. If you turn to page 5 of your Exhibit 2 -- not this one. This one. If you're in an area where there's not as much 19 19 competition, you don't have to price as low, so A. Okay. 20 20 they may not lose money on their eggs. Q. If you see the top entry there, you see 21 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: How do you determine under Source the Bates number for this document 22 the price that you charge customers for eggs? corresponds with the top number on that Bates

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

14 (Pages 50 to 53)

50	52
¹ number?	<sup>1</sup> Q. Okay.
<sup>2</sup> A. Okay.	A. I do not.
Q. You agree that's the same number listed	Q. Okay. You can set this one aside.
in Exhibit A on behalf of Albertsons?	MS. CRABTREE: Let's mark Exhibit 5.
5 A. Yes.	5 (Albertsons Exhibit 5 marked.)
Q. Okay. If you could turn to trie	WIS. CRADTREE. THE bates is ALDEGED 3.
well, first, do you know who Mariard Egg Farms is?	THE WITNESS. OKAY.
A. Tuo not.	Q. BT W.S. CRABTREE. DO you recognize this
Q. Do you know if you've ever received	document:
eggs from Manard Egg Farms?	A. Thave not seem it before, but I I
A. I do not.	know what it is.
Q. Okay. And if you look at the last page	Q. What is it?
of Exhibit 4, it says "Exhibit '1', Egg Pricing	A. It's a cost change notification.
14 Schedule"?	Q. Okay. And the cover page looks to be
15 A. Um-hum.	similar to the the pricing structure we saw in
Q. And then there's a series of three	the previous document, and it indicates "New
columns in the middle of that page. Can you tell	Market" and "Old Market" and lists the effective
me what that those columns mean?	date as January 18th, 2009. Is this similar to
A. "Size" is the is the description of	the type of cost change you would receive on a
the eggs, from jumbo, extra large, or large eggs.	<sup>20</sup> weekly basis?
The "Market" speaks to the Urner Barry regional	A. Yes.
market and the size for each one. And then the	Q. And you see at the bottom it says
51	53
last column is the underage or discount off of	<sup>1</sup> "Distribution" and there's a Moark LLC E-mail
<sup>2</sup> Urner Barry.	
Q. Okay. And do you know which Urner	address for "Martha." Do you know who that is?  A. I do not.
oh, it does say "Urner Barry Southeast market,"	Q. And underneath that, it says "Diane
5 correct?	5 Bible" and then lists an Albertsons' LLC E-mail
6 A. South Central.	address. Do you know who Diane Bible is?
7 Q. Oh	A. I do.
1	
8 MR. MURRAY: SC.	8 Q. Who is that?
9 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Okay. Do you see in	9 A. She is a department specialist in the
the paragraph the second paragraph, that starts	Southwest division.
Manard will sell eggs	Q. What department:
A. Oni-inini.	A. Dairy department.
Q and then it says such prices based	Q. And underneath that, it lists a
on a previous weeks mursuay southeast market !	Roberta Brezinsky with a Moark address. Do you
A. Okay.	15 know who that is?
Q. And you said you you saw "South	16 A. I do not.
17 Central." Where did you see South Central?	Q. And a "cc" to Stan Foster. Do you know
A. Under Market in the column section.	who Stan Foster is?
19 "SC" stands for South Central.	A. I do.
Q. Okay. Do you know which market you	Q. Who is that?
were purchasing eggs from from Cal-Maine in 2007?	A. He was our account exec for Moark at
A. I do not.	that time for covering the New Mexico market.

#### Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

15 (Pages 54 to 57)

54 56 Q. And if you look at the second page, had with the Southwest folks? this is -- it looks like the Albertsons Cost A. That was about 20 minutes. Q. And when did that occur? Change Form we saw before, and it looks like this is -- the Bates number on this one is cut off, but A. Yesterday. it ends with BEGED 3. You'll see the vendor is Q. Okay. When did you talk to Mr. Klewin? marked as "McNally Enterprises" -- or "McAnally A. Yesterday as well. Enterprises." Do you know who that is? Q. Okay. Did you also meet with your A. McAnally, um-hmm. lawyers to prepare for today? Q. Oh, there you go. Who is that? A. I did. 10 10 A. They are a -- a part, subdivision of Q. And I don't want to know anything they 11 11 told you, but when did you meet with them? Moark. 12 12 Q. Okay. So the pricing listed in this A. Yesterday. 13 13 cost change form would be Moark prices, correct? Q. But for about how long? 14 A. Correct. A. Three to four hours. 15 15 Q. Okay. And the cost change form, would Q. And you said your retail price is 16 that be generated within Albertsons or would that based off of a competitive market; is that 17 17 be something the vendor sent to you? correct? 18 18 A. The vendor would fill this out and send A. Yes. 19 it over. Q. Who were your competitors for egg 20 20 Q. Okay. So you provide this form to your sales? 21 MR. MURRAY: When? Objection. You better 22 22 A. Um-hmm. try to narrow that down because it's changed a lot 55 57 MS. CRABTREE: We only have three minutes Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Do you have set left on our tape, so it might be a good time for our break. regions? You mentioned your Southwest Region. THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are off the record. A. Um-hum. (Recess taken.) Q. What other regions do you have? THE VIDEOGRAPHER: All right. So the camera A. Specific to LLC, we have the Southwest Region and the Southern Region. is rolling and we are back on the record. Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: The conversations Q. Any others? that you had to get ready for your deposition, MR. MURRAY: Before or after the --10 when did those take place? Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Well, that's before 11 A. I talk with Marc Nosal just about 11 March, right? 12 every day. But speaking specifically to this, we A. At which time? Yeah. MR. MURRAY: Yeah. 13 13 probably just had conversations over the last 14 three days. 14 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What about 15 Q. Okay. And about how long would you say post-March? 16 16 you spent talking to Mr. Nosal about this? A. Post-March, I have Southern California, 17 17 A. Probably close to an hour all --Northwest, Intermountain, Jewel, Acme, and Shaw's, 18 altogether. in addition to Southwest and Southern. 19 19 Q. Okay. Who are your competitors in the Q. What about Mr. Klewin? I keep wanting 20 20 to call him "McKlewin." Southwest Region? 21 21 A. Probably 20 minutes to a half an hour. A. Walmart, Fries, Safeway, Bashas, Q. And what about the conference call you Costco. All -- all the big grocery retailers that

## Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

16 (Pages 58 to 61)

58	60
<sup>1</sup> are out there.	competitors. But all, you know, major grocery
<sup>2</sup> Q. And how do you track what they are	<sup>2</sup> retailers.
3 charging for eggs?	<sup>3</sup> Q. And what about Shaw? What area is
4 A. We have people that are assigned to go	4 that?
out and price check the sensitive item list every	5 A. That's the Boston, primarily the Boston
6 week.	<sup>6</sup> area.
<sup>7</sup> Q. And eggs is on the sensitive item list?	Q. And any differences in your competitors
8 A. It is.	8 there?
<sup>9</sup> Q. What else is on the sensitive item	<sup>9</sup> A. Boston, Market Basket is is probably
10 list?	one of the biggest competitors in that area,
A. Ground beef, bananas, bread, milk.	ShopRite, Shop N Save, A&P, Ahold.
Q. What about in the Southern Region? Who	Q. What is Ahold?
are your main competitors?	A. Ahold is a it's a holding or it's
<sup>14</sup> A. Kroger, Tom Thumb, Walmart, HEB, Aldi,	a it's a the parent company is based in
15 Costco.	Europe somewhere, and they they own a chain of
Q. Costco is everywhere, isn't it?	grocery stores along the east coast.
A. As is Walmart and and Kroger and	Q. Okay. We're going to take a look at
Safeway. It's all the same folks, just in each	18 Exhibit 6 now.
division they're called different names.	19 (Albertsons Exhibit 6 marked.)
<sup>20</sup> Q. Okay. So in the Southern California	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: When you're ready,
Region, would it be the same list?	can you tell me what Exhibit is?
A. Yes.	A. It is a bid sheet for an egg supply
59	61
<sup>1</sup> Q. And for the Northwest?	¹ contract.
2 A. The same.	<sup>2</sup> Q. How often do you put your eggs out to
3 Q. And for Intermountain?	3 bid?
4 A. The same.	4 A. It varies. But typically, about every
5 Q. Any differences in the Jewel market?	5 two years.
6 A. Jewel has a little bit different	MS. ZIEMIANEK: What is the Bates number on
competitor, and Walmart doesn't have as big of a	
8 presence there. Mariano's is a major competitor	8 MS. CRABTREE: Oh, I'm sorry, because I
9 in that area.	g didn't say it. It's ALBEGED 671. Sorry, Maggie.
<sup>10</sup> Q. What area is that?	<sup>10</sup> MS. ZIEMIANEK: No problem. Thanks.
11 A. Chicagoland.	11 Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: And is this a form
Q. Any others in that area?	that Albertsons would provide to the bidders?
A. Dominicks, which is a division of	A. Yes.
Safeway. Costco, of course.	Q. Okay. And you see it says "Supplier
<sup>15</sup> Q. What area does Acme cover?	Name" at the top, "Hickman's Family Farms" and
A. That's the Pennsylvania, Philadelphia	then under that "Payment Terms"? What does that
<sup>17</sup> area.	mean, the "Payment Terms"?
<sup>18</sup> Q. And any differences in competitors	A. It means that after the receipt of the
19 there?	goods and the receipt of the invoice, we are
A. They have some different competitors	required to pay them within 14 days.
out there. There's Ahold, A&P, Giant, Market	Q. Okay. And then you see under that it
Basket, ShopRite. A lot of a lot of different	says "South Central Urner Barry Index," and then a
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

17 (Pages 62 to 65)

	62	64
1	"Proposed Underage" which is my new favorite	<sup>1</sup> A. It doesn't say on here, but I believe
2	word.	that I executed this in early 2011.
3	Then next to that, it lists "Current,"	<sup>3</sup> Q. So the the 2011 bid you referred to?
4	"Variance" and "Savings." Is that something that	<sup>4</sup> A. Um-hum.
5	Albertsons fills out once it gets the bid or is	Q. And did Hickman's prevail?
6	this filled out by Hickman's?	<sup>6</sup> A. They did in well, let me see. Where
7	A. That's something that Albertsons fills	is this? Yes. This is where this is the New
8	out after the fact.	8 Mexico business that Hickman's did take over.
9	Q. So the stuff to the left of the shaded	<sup>9</sup> Q. How do you know that?
10	box would be something that Hickman's fills out or	A. Just because I I did it.
11	the whole thing is what Albertsons does?	<sup>11</sup> Q. Because it's your job, right?
12	A. Albertsons does everything except for	A. Yes. This was my bid.
13	what's in the shaded area, and the shaded area is	Q. To your understanding, what affects the
14	what's filled out by the supplier.	price that you pay your suppliers for eggs? What
15	Q. Okay. Do you keep these for all bids?	factors affect that price?
16	A. Um-hum.	A. I'm sorry. Can you ask the question
17	Q. Do you have an electronic file of them?	17 again?
18	A. I do.	<sup>18</sup> Q. To your understanding, you get these
19	Q. Who kept them before you came to	weekly price quotes
20	Albertsons in 2010?	A. Um-hum.
21	A. This process would have been performed	Q what affects that price of eggs?
22	by SUPERVALU.	A. Just the Urner Barry. My my price
	63	65
1	Q. And you referred to a "transitional	is predicated off of whatever the Urner Barry
2	agreement"?	<sup>2</sup> publishes.
3	A. Transition Service Agreement.	<sup>3</sup> Q. And if you see the price of eggs go up,
4	Q. Transition Service Agreement. Do you	do you ever get asked for an explanation or get an
5	have a copy of that?	explanation as to why the price of eggs is going
6	A. I do not.	6 up?
7	Q. Do you know who does have a copy of	<sup>7</sup> A. No.
8	that?	<sup>8</sup> Q. So do you have any understanding of
9	A. I would imagine our legal team does,	the factors that go into that Urner Barry price
10	but I I do not have one.	10 quote?
11	MS. CRABTREE: Which is Kevin, we haven't	A. There are opinions that are published
12	been able to find that, so that will probably be a	along with the Urner Barry, market publications
13	follow-up from me.	that kind of explain what they base their quote
14	MR. MURRAY: Okay. I don't know about	off of.
15	that. We'll take whatever follow-up under	<sup>15</sup> Q. And you said you only buy UEP certified
16	advisement.	eggs, correct?
17	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: And, again, these	<sup>17</sup> A. Correct.
18	would be for certified eggs; is that correct?	Q. Do you put the UEP certified logo on
19	A. Correct. These are UEP certified	all of your private label packaging?
20	eggs.	<sup>20</sup> A. I do not know.
21	Q. Do you know what time period this bid	Q. Where would you go to find that out?
22	sheet would relate to?	A. I'd I would call our packaging

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

18 (Pages 66 to 69)

1.		,
	66	68
1	supplier or go look at a go look at a package.	<sup>1</sup> Gary Angell?
2	Q. Who is your packaging supplier?	<sup>2</sup> A. Yes.
3	A. We have a couple of different	<sup>3</sup> Q. What was his position?
4	suppliers. Pactiv is our primary supplier of	A. He's held a variety of positions. I
5	molded pulp, and Dolco is our primary supplier of	5 think at the very end he was in charge of
6	foam packaging.	specialty foods, if I remember correctly.
7	Q. I'm sorry. Who was the foam again?	Q. Do you carry any eggs other than your
8	A. Foam is Dolco.	8 private label eggs now?
9	Q. Dolco.	9 A. Um-hum.
10	MR. MURRAY: You might want to spell that if	Q. What other?
11	you know.	MR. MURRAY: You have to say yes or no.
12	THE WITNESS: D-o-l-c-o.	THE WITNESS: Oh, yes.
13	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: We would just ask you	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What other eggs do
14	later anyway.	you carry, or what other brands.
15	When you were offered non-certified UEP	15 A. We have a lot of brands. It varies by
16	eggs by Hidden Villa, why didn't you go with the	region. We have Land O'Lakes. We have Eggland's
17	cheaper, non-certified eggs?	Best. We have regional brands in in each
18	A. We we want to keep our program	18 particular area.
19	consistent and make sure that we're supplying our	Q. What about for commodity eggs? Do you
20	customers with the the same quality yesterday	carry any competing brands within with your
21	as they get tomorrow.	21 private labels?
22	Q. What is the most what do you look to	A. In some in some areas we do, yes.
	,	A. Ili some Ili some areas we do, yes.
	67	69
1	to determine who your egg suppliers are going to	<sup>1</sup> Q. Okay. And do you usually price your
2	be? What factors do you look at?	private label less than the other commodity egg
3	A. Ability to supply is probably first and	brands that you're carrying?
4	foremost. Price is always right up there, as far	<sup>4</sup> A. Yes.
5	as what's required, and then quality to make sure	Q. Do you carry any non-UEP certified
6	that they are going to be able to provide a good	6 commodity eggs?
7	quality carton, good service, good eggs.	A. That is it's possible. I I don't
8	Q. Anything else?	8 know, to be certain.
9	A. No.	<sup>9</sup> Q. When you run a sale or promotion on
10	Q. UEP certification would be one?	eggs, what does that do to your volume of sales?
11	A. That's yeah. That's mandatory to	A. It increases unit movement, but doesn't
12	even participate in the bid.	always increase dollar sales.
13	Q. When you were with old Albertsons, did	Q. If I wanted to find out how many eggs
14	you have anything to do with egg procurement?	you that Albertsons bought in 2012 from each
15	A. I did not.	supplier, how would I do that?
16	Q. Do you know who did?	A. In for 2012, there should be
17	A. At the very end, the the lady that	purchase records at the distribution center.
18	was in charge of sourcing, her name was Darlene	
19	Boyce.	as, let's say, pre-March of this year?
20	Q. B-o-y-c-e?	20 A. The only one that handled eggs would
21	A. Yes.	have been in Tollefson, Arizona. Tollefson
22	Q. Did you ever have any dealings with	Phoenix, Arizona.
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
1		

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

19 (Pages 70 to 73)

	70		72
1	Q. Okay. That's your only distribution	1	bid on Albertsons business?
2	center that handles eggs?	2	A. Not that I'm aware of.
3	A. That handles eggs.	3	Q. We talked about Cal-Maine. We talked
4	Q. Prior to March of this year?	4	about Sparboe.
5	A. Correct.	5	A. Um-hum.
6	Q. And if I wanted to know how much how	6	Q. Have you ever had any discussions with
7	many eggs you sold to customers last year, where	7	Sparboe about a process verified program?
8	would I look?	8	A. Yes.
9	A. We can pull scan data out of the data	9	Q. And can you tell me about that?
10	warehouse to to determine how many dozens o	<b>r</b> 10	A. They use that in place of UEP
11	units of of each egg were sold.	11	certification is my understanding.
12	Q. And when you say "the data warehouse,"	12	Q. So have you purchased eggs under the
13	what is that?	13	process verified program?
14	A. All of the scan data that that goes	14	A. We did.
15	through the registers all feeds into a data	15	Q. Did those eggs cost more or less than
16	warehouse.	16	your UEP certified eggs?
17	Q. Do you know if that's a database or a	17	A. They didn't necessarily cost more or
18	particular type of database?	18	less. They were contracted as off of the Urner
19	A. I don't know.	19	Barry. So they they were based off of whatever
20	Q. Who would know?	20	we negotiated as an underage from Urner Barry.
21	A. Probably our IT department.	21	MS. CRABTREE: Let's go ahead and mark
22	Q. Do you maintain a particular margin	22	Exhibit 7.
	71		73
1	between what you pay for eggs and what you sell	1	(Albertsons Exhibit 7 marked.)
2	them for?	2	MS. CRABTREE: And this is SVL_EGGS_20594.
3	A. Not really. For the most part, we	3	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: You kind of have to
4	we base our pricing, our retail prices off of	4	look at this a little backwards. The first page
5	whatever the market is doing. So it's it's	5	is the "First Amendment to Our Brands Supply
6	hard to maintain a certain margin if if the	6	Agreement," followed by an E-mail.
7	retail market doesn't allow you to.	7	A. Okay.
8	Q. Have you ever purchased eggs or egg	8	Q. Have you ever seen this document
9	products from Rose Acre Farms?	9	before?
10	A. Not directly, that I'm aware of.	10	A. I have not.
11	Q. Have they ever bid on your egg	11	Q. Fair enough.
12	business, do you know?	12	And I'll represent to you it looks like
13	A. Not with me. They may have with	13	this document is a contract change form. It
14	SUPERVALU when SUPERVALU was conducting bids.	14	indicates removal of animal care certification
15	Q. Have you ever purchased egg or egg	15	number and the addition of the language, "Supplier
16	products from Midwest Poultry?	16	shall maintain standard industry animal care
17	A. Not that I am aware of.	17	guidelines throughout the term of the agreement
18	Q. What about NuCal?	18	for products provided to Albertsons."
19	A. Yes.	19	MR. MURRAY: This is I point out for the
20	Q. Yeah, we went over that, correct?	20	record, this is old Albertsons, Albertsons, Inc.,
21	A. Um-hum.	21	not Albertsons LLC.
22	Q. Do you know if Midwest Poultry has ever	22	MS. CRABTREE: And I get that. I just
	Q. Do you know it wildwest Foultry Has ever		MO. ONADTINEE. And I get that. I just

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

20 (Pages 74 to 77)

7.4	70
74	76
Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Does this indicate to	Q. Have you ever received inquiries from
you that Sparboe was given permission to be	customers about animal welfare for the products
non-UEP certified while providing eggs to	that Albertsons sells?
<sup>4</sup> Albertsons?	<sup>4</sup> A. I have not, no.
<sup>5</sup> MR. MURRAY: Inc.	<sup>5</sup> Q. Have you ever received any attention
6 MS. CRABTREE: Inc.	from animal rights groups about animal welfare for
7 THE WITNESS: To the original Albertsons,	the products that Albertsons sells?
<sup>8</sup> that's what it looks like.	8 A. I have not.
<sup>9</sup> Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Was Sparboe permitted	<sup>9</sup> Q. Who would handle those inquiries if a
to provide non-UEP certified eggs to current	customer made an inquiry about animal welfare?
11 Albertsons?	A. Today, it would probably be our
12 A. Yes.	director of communications or communications
Q. And that was provided they provide them	department, I guess.
under this process verified program?	Q. And who is that?
A. I'm assuming that it was that it was	<sup>15</sup> A. Chris Chris Wilcox, Christine
provided they maintain standard industry animal	16 Wilcox.
17 care guidelines.	Q. And you say "today." How far back
<sup>18</sup> Q. Okay. So for current Albertsons	<sup>18</sup> would that go?
19 A. Um-hum.	A. Until whenever I don't know when she
<sup>20</sup> Q you were buying eggs from Sparboe	came on board.
until 2011, correct?	Q. But that would be the position that
A. Correct.	would respond to that?
75	77
<sup>1</sup> Q. Were the were those eggs produced	<sup>1</sup> A. Um-hum.
<sup>2</sup> under the UEP certified program or the process	<sup>2</sup> Q. Fair enough.
3 verified program?	MS. CRABTREE: Let's mark Exhibit 8.
<sup>4</sup> A. To my knowledge, they were under the	<sup>4</sup> (Albertsons Exhibit 8 marked.)
5 process verified program.	<sup>5</sup> MS. CRABTREE: Oh, this is ALBEGED 579.
<sup>6</sup> Q. So Albertsons was purchasing non-UEP	6 THE WITNESS: Okay.
7 certified eggs, correct?	<sup>7</sup> Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Do you know what this
<sup>8</sup> A. Yes.	s is?
<sup>9</sup> Q. We got there.	<sup>9</sup> A. It looks to be a recommended
Have you ever purchased any eggs from	promotional calendar from Eggland's Best.
<sup>11</sup> Ohio Fresh?	Q. Would this be a document that
<sup>12</sup> A. Not to my knowledge.	Albertsons would generate or that you would
<sup>13</sup> Q. What about Daybreak Foods?	receive from a supplier?
<sup>14</sup> A. Not to my knowledge.	14 A. Supplier.
<sup>15</sup> Q. What about Sauder?	<sup>15</sup> Q. Is this the type of a document you
A. No, not to my knowledge.	would receive?
Q. And you said you were purchasing liquid	17 A. No.
eggs from Michael's, correct?	Q. Are you involved at all in the planning
<sup>19</sup> A. We have in the past, yes.	of temporary is it TPR, temporary price
Q. Have you ever purchased shell eggs from	<sup>20</sup> reduction?
<sup>21</sup> Michael Foods?	A. That's correct terminology. No, I am
A. Not that I'm aware of.	not involved.

#### Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

21 (Pages 78 to 81)

78 80 Q. Okay. To your knowledge -- if you --Q. So if we pull the data on your egg if you look at the last page, I think that's the purchases, let's say for last year, that would not easiest one to look at. The last column here include any of the allowances or payments that you indicates "National Television." Do you know what might have received for specials? that means? A. The allowances can come in several A. My assumption is that Eggland's Best different forms. So some of them impact direct was running television advertising during those purchase cost of goods. Some of them impact after weeks. the fact. Q. Okay. And do you -- do you know, do Q. Okay. Do you participate in any 10 you typically plan your -- your specials and sales 10 grocery cooperatives? 11 up to a year in advance? A. No. Not that I'm aware of. 12 A. No, we do not. Q. Do you subscribe to any periodical or 13 Q. You do not. That was easy. 13 magazine or publication related to the egg 14 Is the UEP certified program in place 14 industry? 15 because you believe you get higher quality eggs A. No. 16 from that program? 16 Q. Do you ever receive United Voices? 17 A. No. 17 18 Q. Is it because Albertsons has concern 18 Q. Okay. Have you ever had any about the hen welfare of the eggs that it gets? 19 communications with anyone from UEP? 20 A. No. 20 A. No, I don't believe I have. 21 Q. Why is it important that Albertsons 21 Q. What facts does Albertsons have that 22 have the UEP certification? 22 Rose Acre Farms conspired to increase egg prices? 81 A. Mostly, for the consistency of the --MR. MURRAY: Objection to the form of the the shop for the customer. question. It invades the attorney-client work Q. Okay. But you don't know whether it's product privilege. on the cartons or not? You can answer if you know anything A. I do not know. outside of what you've learned from communications Q. Do you know what "slotting" is? with counsel. A. I do. THE WITNESS: I -- I don't know of any. Q. What is it? Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: We're going to go A. It is a fee that is sometimes charged through a list of these though. to manufacturers for placement of products. A. Okay. 11 Q. You said it is a fee to the 11 Q. What facts do you have that Midwest 12 12 manufacturers. Would that be your suppliers? Poultry conspired to increase egg prices? 13 13 MR. MURRAY: Same -- same objection and same A. Correct. 14 Q. Do your commodity egg suppliers ever 14 caution. 15 15 pay slotting fees? You can answer if you know any facts 16 16 A. No. outside of communications you've had with counsel. 17 17 Q. We talked a little bit earlier about THE WITNESS: I do not know of any. 18 promotions and sometimes your suppliers will give Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you 19 you a price break to run a particular promotion. 19 have that NuCal conspired to increase egg prices? 20 20 Accountingwise, would that information be in the MR. MURRAY: Same objection and the same 21 21 same place as the price you pay for eggs? caution about communications with counsel. A. Not necessarily. THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.

# Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

22 (Pages 82 to 85)

	82	84
1	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you	is rolling. We are back on the record.
2	have that Cal-Maine conspired to increase egg	<sup>2</sup> Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: Have you ever
3	prices?	<sup>3</sup> received instructions not to destroy any documents
4	MR. MURRAY: Same objection, same caution.	4 related to this case?
5	THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.	5 A. I have.
6	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you	<sup>6</sup> Q. Do you remember when that was?
7	have that Sparboe Farms conspired to increase egg	A. It was right after I first came on
8	prices?	8 board with the LLC, so 2010.
9	MR. MURRAY: Same objection and same	<sup>9</sup> Q. And have you ever been asked to gather
10	caution.	information related to this case?
11	THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.	A. Nothing more than just saving the
12	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you	documents that everything that has to do with
13	have that Moark conspired to increase egg prices?	eggs.
14	MR. MURRAY: Same objection and same	Q. Do you have a non-Albertsons E-mail
15	caution.	15 address?
16	THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.	A. Yes.
17	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you	Q. Do you ever conduct business through
18	have that Ohio Fresh conspired to increase egg	that E-mail address?
19	prices?	<sup>19</sup> A. No.
20	MR. MURRAY: Same objection, same caution.	MS. CRABTREE: Well, that was anticlimactic.
21	THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.	l think I'm done for today.
22	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you	MR. MURRAY: Did you have any questions?
	83	85
1	have that Hillandale Farms conspired to increase	<sup>1</sup> MS. CRABTREE: Do you have any further
2	egg prices?	<sup>2</sup> MR. ESSENMACHER: Indirect purchasers have
3	MR. MURRAY: Same objection, same caution.	<sup>3</sup> no questions.
4	THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.	MR. MURRAY: Does anybody on the phone have
5	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you	5 any questions?
6	have that Michael's Foods conspired to increase	6 MS. ZIEMIANEK: None from me.
7	egg prices?	<sup>7</sup> MS. MARKOWITZ: No.
8	MR. MURRAY: Same objection, same caution.	8 MR. MURRAY: Okay. I have two very brief
9	THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.	<sup>9</sup> questions.
10	Q. BY MS. CRABTREE: What facts do you	10 EXAMINATION
11	have that Sauder, Inc. or R.W. Sauder conspired to	11 BY MR. MURRAY:
12	increase egg prices?	Q. Mr. Pontius, is it your understanding
13	MR. MURRAY: Same objection and same	that Albertsons LLC has retained counsel to
14	caution.	prosecute this lawsuit against the the egg
15	THE WITNESS: I do not know of any.	producers?
16	MS. CRABTREE: Can we go off the record for	A. That's my understanding, yes.
17	just a minute.	Q. And it is is it also your
18	MR. MURRAY: Sure.	understanding that Albertsons LLC is relying on
19	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. And we are off the	its counsel to gather the facts necessary to
20	record.	prosecute this antitrust case against the egg
21	(Recess taken.)	producers?
22	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: All right. So the camera	A. Yes.
il .	VIDEOGIA TIETA 741 figita Oo tilo odifiera	,

Pontius, Robert

August 29, 2013

23 (Pages 86 to 88)

	25 (1 ages 60 to 60)
86	88
MR. MURRAY: Okay. I have no further questions.  MS. CRABTREE: Ta-da. THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. So we are off the record. (The deposition concluded at 11:09 a.m.) -oo0oo-  R  9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I, BROOKE R. BOHR, a Notary Public in and for the State of Idaho, do hereby certify: That prior to being examined, the witness named in the foregoing deposition was by me duly sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth; That said deposition was taken down by me in shorthand at the time and place therein named and thereafter reduced into typewriting under my direction, and that the foregoing transcript contains a full, true, and verbatim record of the said deposition.  I further certify that I have no interest in the event of the action. WITNESS my hand and seal September 9, 2013.  NOTARY PUBLIC in and for the State of Idaho; residing at Meridian, Idaho.  My commission expires September 7, 2019. CSR No. 753
87	
VERIFICATION STATE OF IDAHO  County of Ada  I, ROBERT PONTIUS, being first duly sworn on my oath, depose and say: That I am the witness named in the foregoing deposition, taken on August 29, 2013, consisting of pages numbered 1 to 88, inclusive; That I have read the said deposition and know the contents thereof; that the questions contained therein were propounded to me; that the answers to said questions were given by me, and that the answers as contained therein (or as corrected by me therein) are true and correct.  DEPONENT  Signed and sworn before me this of , .  NOTARY PUBLIC Residing at My commission expires	